

Application Number

P/2013/0034

Site Address

Churston Golf Club Site
Dartmouth Road
Brixham
Devon

Case Officer

Mrs Helen Addison

Ward**Description**

Formation of 42 extra care flats and communal facilities with associated landscaping and parking. Revised plans received showing revised design and layout.

Executive Summary/Key Outcomes

This is the reserved matters submission for the 42 bedroom extra care building that would provide the affordable housing element of the residential development on the site of the existing golf club house, 1st and 18th tees. The principle of the proposed building has been agreed at outline stage. The detailed plans show a well designed building that would relate well to its setting and would have an appropriate scale and design for this location.

Recommendation

Subject to no new issues being raised during the consultation period that expires on 14.3.13, reserved matters consent be granted for appearance, layout and scale of the building. Landscaping is not approved as the details have not been submitted with this application.

Statutory Determination Period

This application is a major reserved matters submission and as such the determination period is 13 weeks. The application must therefore be determined no later than 19 April 2013 in order to have been determined in time. Officers have anticipated a determination in time before the end of March in this case and included this in projecting performance for the 2012/13 year.

Site Details

The application site relates to land that forms part of the existing Golf Club House and 1st and 18th tees situated on the north side of Dartmouth Road and to the west of the steam railway line. The site covers 0.54 hectares and measures approximately 45 metres in width by 125 metres in length.

The existing ground level of the site is approx. 1.5 metres lower than road level.

The boundary to Dartmouth Road is partly delineated with a chain link fence and part a stone wall. There are views across the site from Dartmouth Road. The site is currently grassed, forming part of the 18th hole. Along the eastern boundary to the steam railway line there is a linear group of mature trees. Adjacent to the south east boundary is a pedestrian underpass. There is also a bus stop adjacent to the site on Dartmouth Road.

The surrounding area has a number of different uses. To the north and east is part of the golf course and the current golf club house. To the south there is a recreation ground and Churston Grammar School. Immediately to the east is the steam railway line and on the opposite side of the railway line is a mix of residential and commercial uses. There is no designation of the application site in the Torbay Local Plan 1995-2011. The railway line to the east is designated as a local wildlife site in the Torbay Local Plan 1995-2011.

Detailed Proposals

This submission is the reserved matters application for the construction of a 42 bedroom extra care building with parking and landscaping. Outline consent was granted under application reference P/2011/0829. At outline stage the only approved matter was access. Layout, appearance and scale are outstanding matters to be determined in this application. Landscaping remains outstanding.

The proposed building would comprise 32 x 1 bedroom 2 person extra care flats and 10 x 2 bedroom 3 person extra care flats. The communal facilities would comprise a restaurant, library/internet café, shop, salon, multipurpose room and a mobility scooter store. The applicant advises that the Extra Care model provides more comprehensive support to older people than standard sheltered housing and offering greater flexibility and independence than residential care homes. The principle of the provision is that as a resident's needs grow, the onsite support is tailored to suit their individual needs. This can include specialist care for those suffering from dementia. Extra care provides self contained flats and bungalows to mobility or wheelchair standards and offers personal care, domestic help and a meals service if required. A range of communal facilities and activities would be provided which will also be open to people in the wider community.

The submitted plan shows a predominantly two storey building with two apartments at second floor level, which essentially has a linear footprint that extends across the site boundary to Dartmouth Road and also along the eastern boundary of the site adjacent to the railway line. The apartments would be arranged either side of a central corridor. The main communal facilities would be located centrally within the building. This location would also enable the communal facilities to be accessed by the community without the privacy and security of residents being compromised. A private communal garden would be provided along the railway side of the building. Car parking would be provided at

the front of the building. Twelve parking spaces are proposed with an additional minibus drop off bay and a bay for ambulance/deliveries/maintenance parking. Three spaces would be allocated for disabled users.

The external appearance would comprise a number of projecting gables to both the west and south west elevations and a less detailed elevation to the east, with a number of balconies. The west and south west elevation (that faces Dartmouth Road) would be visually broken up by recessed links with low pitch roofs. Materials would be white rendered walls with natural effect reconstituted stone to the gable projections, plinth copings and window cills, grey concrete roof tiles with a low pitch metal roof over the communal lounge. Windows would be dark grey polyester powder coated aluminium. Balustrading would be glass with dark grey metal work to match windows and doors.

The layout plan shows a number of new trees would be planted along the south west elevation facing Dartmouth Road and the west elevation.

This proposal would provide the affordable housing element of the overall development of up to 90 dwellings on the wider site of the 1st and 18th tees that was approved under application reference P/2011/0829.

Summary Of Consultation Responses

Brixham Town Council: Recommend refusal due to lack of information with regards to access to site and lack of parking spaces.

Summary Of Representations

One letter of representation reproduced at Page B.200

Relevant Planning History

- | | |
|---------------------|---|
| P/2011/0829 | Demolition of clubhouse, outbuildings and care park and development comprising up to 90 dwellings, 42 bed extra care scheme (use C3 extra care); informal open space; landscaped areas, new vehicular/pedestrian access and sustainable drainage measures and all necessary infrastructure, engineering works and landscaping (in outline) approved 20.12.12. |
| 1996/0989 | Demolition of Clubhouse And Erection Of New Clubhouse And Trolley Store (As Revised By Letter And Plans Dated 22nd October 1996) per 1.11.96 |
| 1995/1191 1995/1191 | Demolition of Existing Clubhouse And Erection Of New Clubhouse (As Annotated On Plans 05/01/96) approved 5.1.96 |

The following applications not on the application site are also considered relevant;

P/2013/0019 Site 1- Development of golf club house, coach facility, buggy store, car park, vehicular access, works to Bridge Road and Bascombe Road

Site 2 - Change of Use and re-grading of 7.7 hectares of agricultural land for use as golf course; change of use of 1.3 hectares of land from equine use to use for cattle grazing and all associated infrastructure, engineering works and landscaping.(Revised Scheme)

Site 1-Land At Churston Golf Course / Churston Golf Club,north East Of Bascombe Road Opposite The Northern End Of Bridge Road, Churston, Brixham

Site 2 - Land At Churston Golf Course / Churston Golf Club, North East Of Churston Court Farm. Current application

P/2012/1194 Site 1- Development of golf club house, coach facility, buggy store, car park, vehicular access, works to Bridge Road and Bascombe Road

Site 2 - Change of Use and re-grading of 7.7 hectares of agricultural land for use as golf course; change of use of 1.3 hectares of land from equine use to use for cattle grazing and all associated infrastructure, engineering works and landscaping.

Site 1-Land At Churston Golf Course / Churston Golf Club,north East Of Bascombe Road Opposite The Northern End Of Bridge Road, Churston, Brixham

Site 2 - Land At Churston Golf Course / Churston Golf Club, North East Of Churston Court Farm. Application Withdrawn. 21.01.2013

2011/0838 Change of use of agricultural land for use as a golf course; development of a clubhouse, car park and golf trolley store ; a new vehicular access and road from green lane ; a new practice area with associated small building and practice putting green; and works to form three replacement tees,

fairways and greens; all associated infrastructure engineering works and landscaping. Refused 26.7.12.

Key Issues/Material Considerations

Principle and Planning Policy -

The principle of the development on this site was approved under application reference P/2011/0829. The issues to be considered are whether the layout, appearance and scale are appropriate in this location.

Layout, appearance and scale -

The location of the extra care building on this part of the site follows the indicative layout plan submitted with the outline application. There would be no objection to siting the building in this location. The visual impact of a building on this scale would be effectively accommodated through its location adjacent to the site boundary. The linear form of the building would relate to the boundary line adjacent to the railway which would assist in assimilating the building into the site.

The proposed building would address the Dartmouth Road frontage, which would be consistent with the established layout of buildings in the area. Following negotiations with the architect the original south eastern element of the building that would have appeared discordant with the main form of the building has been removed and these apartments accommodated on the second floor. In addition the scheme has been revised to break the elevations down into smaller elements to reflect the domestic scale of buildings in the immediate area. A section has been submitted that shows the floor level of the building would be 1.5 metres below pavement level. Visually this would help to soften the impact of the building in the street scene.

The proposal, as submitted, is predominantly for a two storey building which would be consistent with the character of the area. The revision to reduce the foot print of the building in the south east corner of the site has enabled a reduction in the footprint of the building. The reduction in footprint has resulted in additional space on site to be used as a garden by residents and has also improved the appearance of the building in the street scene and the relationship of the building to its setting.

The proposed design of the west elevation would be an appropriate treatment for this building. The projecting gables finished in reconstituted stone would provide visual relief to the main elevation of this building, and would work to break up the mass of the building. The principle of using projecting gables would reflect the character of the nearby Churston village. The main entrance of the building would be located towards the northern end of the site. It would be distinguished

by a double height overhang. The eastern elevation of the building facing the railway line would have less external detailing as it would be less visible in the street scene. There would be a number of projecting balconies.

There was some concern about the quality of living accommodation that would be provided in a number of east facing apartments that would look directly on the existing trees. The amount of natural light that would be able to enter these apartments would have been limited. Therefore the architect was asked to consider whether the building could be moved to the west further from the existing trees. This has been achieved and the revised plan shows the building moved two metres to the west which will improve the residential amenity for occupants.

Para. 56 of the NPPF states that “good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, and is indivisible from good planning, and should contribute positively to making places better for people”. At paragraph 60 it is advised that “planning ..decisions should not attempt to impose architectural styles or particular tastes and they should not stifle innovation, originality or initiative through unsubstantial requirements to conform to certain development or styles. It is, however, proper to seek to promote or reinforce local distinctiveness”.

There is no objection to the overall design approach of the proposed development. Following submission of the application the architect has submitted a number of improvements to the siting and external appearance of the building which will improve both its appearance and function.

Environmental Enhancement -

In the design and access statement it is acknowledged that a quality landscape scheme should be provided as part of the application to provide a high quality of environment for residents that are likely to have reduced mobility and for outdoor recreational space to be available for occupants. The layout plan provides an indication of planting that will be carried out on the site, although this will need to be formally agreed when the landscaping scheme is submitted. There are acknowledged health benefits for the elderly of providing a good quality living environment and well planted accessible gardens would encourage outdoor activity. The proposed layout plan shows an area of private communal garden space would be provided in the south east corner of the site. A small patio area would also be provided adjacent to the communal lounge.

The existing line of mature trees along the eastern boundary would be retained as part of this proposal. They provide a distinctive and strong landscape feature in this part of the site. The arboricultural officer has advised that the proposed development is suitable for approval on arboricultural merit.

The railway land to the east of the site is designated as a wildlife site in the Torbay Local Plan 1995-2011. Under outline application reference P/2011/0829

the Environmental Statement considered this site in Appendix 6.8. It advised that the majority of the site was likely to be of limited value to foraging Greater Horseshoe Bats however the Torbay-Dartmouth Railway line to the east of the site was identified as a suitable commuting/foraging corridor for Greater Horseshoe Bats. It was stated that measures to avoid impacts upon this feature would be incorporated into the scheme design from an early stage. These measures included the provision of a timber fence (1.8m approx. in height) along this boundary to protect the wildlife corridor to prevent disturbance from light spill. In addition it was advised that any lighting should be kept to a minimum and where essential will be low level and directed away from the railway line so that disturbance to any commuting and foraging bats from light pollution is avoided. Other identified measures were the incorporation of bird and bat boxes on both trees along the eastern boundary of the site and the use of specially designed bricks to accommodate nests or bat roosts. The applicant has confirmed that the proposal would incorporate these measures as identified in the Environmental Statement.

Accessibility -

The submitted layout plan shows the provision of a new temporary access road from Dartmouth Road to serve the building. This access would require a separate planning permission and cannot be approved as part of this reserved matters submission. At the current time an application for the temporary access has not been submitted.

The applicant has advised that in order to obtain funding for the development it would be necessary to achieve a construction start in the summer of 2013 in order to achieve completion by the end of 2014. It would be possible to develop this site whilst the golf club remains in operation.

The highway engineer has advised that he would have no objection to the provision of the temporary access during the construction period, however there would be concern about use of this new access once the building is occupied. This is because the creation of an additional access onto a classified road would have an effect on the free flow of traffic along Dartmouth Road.

The implication of a permanent new access onto Dartmouth Road being inappropriate is that the implementation of this scheme is dependent on the outcome of the application for the new golf club house (P/2013/0019). In order that the applicant can be confident that the access to the whole residential site, as agreed at outline stage under application reference P/2011/0829, would be achievable by the time the building would be ready for occupation in early 2015, consent would need to be granted for an alternative clubhouse location. The applicant has advised that if application reference P/2013/0019 is not approved he would be unable to proceed with this application at the current as there would be no funding in place.

The proposed development would have 12 parking spaces, three of which would be allocated for disabled persons. In addition there would be a minibus drop off point and a space for delivery vehicles. The applicant advises that extra care schemes typically have minimal parking provision due to very low levels of car ownership by frail elderly residents with most spaces being available for visitors and staff.

The transportation team have advised that there should be a link from the application site to the bus stop and pedestrian underpass.

Conclusions

In conclusion, the proposed development, as revised, constitutes an acceptable form of development on this site. The layout and external appearance of the building would be acceptable in this location and would respect the established character and form of development in the area. As such it would be consistent with policies H9 and H10 in the Torbay Local Plan 1995-2011.

The applicant has indicated that a temporary access to Dartmouth Road would be required to construct the development, which would need to be the subject of a separate planning application. It would be inappropriate to allow this access to be used on a permanent basis for reasons of traffic flow along Dartmouth Road which is a classified road.

The implementation of this consent is tied to the outcome of application reference P/2013/0019 for the relocation of the golf club house. If this planning consent is not granted the funding availability for the proposed development is short term and may not be available.

Relevant Policies

-