

Minutes of the Health Scrutiny Board

8 April 2010

-: Present :-

Councillor Kerslake (Chairman)

Councillors Carter (C), Manning, Morey, Phillips, and Thomas (J)

(Also in attendance: Councillors Addis and Bent)

557. Apologies.

An apology for absence was received from Councillor John.

558. Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting of the Health Scrutiny Board held on 18 February 2010 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

559. Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre Consultation Feedback

The Board considered Report 98/2010 which provided information and feedback on the formal public consultation undertaken on the proposed Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre. The Board was provided with a provisional project timeline that was dependent on the successful progress of the scheme.

Members questioned what car parking options had been discussed with Torbay Council for the Clennon Valley site. The Board was advised that the car parking issues would be explored following consideration of the full business case by the Strategic Health Authority. The Board was informed that addressing car parking issues was a key concern.

Members questioned whether Withycombe Lodge Surgery and Grosvenor Road Surgery would run a car service for patients to the Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre. In response, members were advised that the hospital car scheme would run and that a small number of patients had expressed concern at the increased journey to the proposed Centre. The Board was advised that the GPs of Withycombe Lodge Surgery and Grosvenor Road Surgery were confident that most of their patients would not be excluded from the proposed centre.

In reply to questioning the Board was informed that both Withycombe Lodge Surgery and Grosvenor Road Surgery were sited in urban areas with very few available parking spaces and it was possible that many patients were already paying for parking.

The Board was advised that the response rate was three per cent of the total leaflets circulated. With reference to the response rate to the leaflet, members suggested that the confidence level of the results were less than forty per cent. In reply the Head of Estates, Torbay NHS Care Trust, indicated that the response rate was not unusual for

such leaflet distributions. Members expressed disappointment at the low response rate from the public and praised the consultation efforts.

Members questioned the distribution of the consultation leaflet, and were advised that 16,400 leaflets had been distributed by the Post Office and 4,000 by a leaflet distribution company.

With reference to gym facilities and a café, members questioned the duplication of facilities at the proposed healthy living centre with existing facilities at Clennon Valley Leisure Centre. Members also questioned whether the proposed centre might be duplicating services offered in Paignton Library and Civic Hub. In reply, the Board was advised that Torbay NHS Care Trust was open to discussion with partners in the area.

Members questioned the cost of the proposed centre and the alternative schemes considered by Torbay NHS Care Trust. The Board was informed that the NHS had budgeted for the scheme and that alternative sites for the scheme had not been identified within Paignton.

With reference to Paignton (Torbay) Rifle and Pistol Club at Clennon Valley, members asked for the latest position and were advised that discussions were ongoing and did not involve Torbay NHS Care Trust. Members suggested the value of obtaining an update on the position.

Members questioned when the latest assurance from Devon Partnership NHS Trust and South Devon Healthcare NHS Foundation Trust had been received endorsing the scheme. In response, the Board was advised that Devon Partnership NHS Trust was represented on the project group and work was ongoing with South Devon Healthcare NHS Foundation Trust concerning the outpatient sessions to be held at the proposed healthy living centre.

The Head of Estates, Torbay NHS Care Trust, informed the meeting that the planning process would deal with the appearance of the building.

Resolved: (i) that the Board be kept advised of progress and developments in connection with the proposed Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre, including the design and full business case; and

(ii) that further information on Paignton (Torbay) Rifle and Pistol Club at Clennon Valley be provided to Health Scrutiny Board members.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 559, Councillor Carter (C) declared a personal interest in the matter as she was a trustee of CHAD and the organisation might be hiring rooms in the proposed Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre.)

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 559, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

560. Torquay North Healthy Living Centre Development

The Board considered Report 102/2010 which provided information about the Torquay North Healthy Living Centre Development.

In response to questions, the Board was advised that the former GA insurance building in Greenway Road was not affordable to Torbay NHS Care Trust as advised by the district valuer.

Resolved: that if developments occur concerning the proposed Torquay North Healthy Living Centre, details be provided to Health Scrutiny Board members.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 560, Councillor Kerslake declared a personal interest in the matter as a patient of Brunel General Practice Surgery.)

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 560, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 560, Councillor Addis declared a personal interest in the matter as the agent of a property he spoke about as a possible site for the Torquay North Healthy Living Centre was known to him.)

561. The Future of Older People's Day Services Consultation – The methodology

The Board considered Report 100/2010 which provided information on the methodology of the consultation on the future of older people's day services. The Board was advised that the consultation would close on 18 April 2010 and it was not appropriate to give an indication of the findings before that date. Members were informed that a total of 483 people had been engaged over the future of older people's day services and the methodology was outlined to the Board.

In reply to questions, the Board was advised that Torbay NHS Care Trust was not at that time requesting a decision as to whether proposed changes to older people's day services constituted a substantial variation to the provision of services or a substantial development to services. The Board was advised that the information requested by the Board in January 2010 [Health Scrutiny Board, 7 January 2010, Minute 377 refers] would be available to members by June 2010.

In response to questions, the Board was advised that details of proposals for older people's day services would be provided to members as soon as possible ahead of the scrutiny meeting to which they were presented.

A representative from Torbay LINK (Local Involvement Network) made representations to the meeting. Members were advised that the LINK had raised concerns about the proposed consultation process at the Torbay NHS Care Trust Board meeting in December 2009 and again in writing prior to the launch of the consultation. Members were informed that the LINK had not received an indication that the concerns raised had been accepted. The Board was advised that the LINK had questioned the decision to exclude from the consultation two of the five options explored in the review process. The Board was informed that the LINK raised concerns that they considered the consultation document did not contain sufficient detail, the consultation choices were restricted and options inadequate, and decisions at a formative stage had been taken prior to public consultation.

Board members stated the duty of NHS organisations to involve users in the consideration of proposals to change services and in the development of any proposal that would change the manner in which a health service was provided or the range of

services offered. In response, the meeting was advised of the engagement activity undertaken by Torbay NHS Care Trust.

Members suggested the value of including Brixham Town Council in the consultation process.

Members questioned whether the implementation of changes to older people's services would be phased in.

Resolved: that detailed information about proposals for future older people's day services in Torbay be provided to the June 2010 meeting of the Health Scrutiny Board.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 561, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

562. Transforming Older People's Mental Health Services

The Board considered Report 99/2010 which updated the Board on plans for the redesign of mental health services for older people in Torbay. The Board was advised that the Board of Devon Partnership NHS Trust had approved capital investment plans to a total value of £4.6 million for the refurbishment of its older people's inpatient wards in Torbay, Barnstaple, and Exeter. Members were informed that £1 million would be invested in a major refurbishment of the Fernworthy Unit at Torbay Hospital.

With reference to the Appendix to Report 99/2010, the Board questioned when the letter advising of Devon Partnership NHS Trust's decision to approve £4.6 million investment was sent to all stakeholders in Torbay. The Board was informed a date could be provided to members.

In response to questions, the Board was assured that the £1 million refurbishment of the Fernworthy Unit would be completed by the summer of 2011.

Resolved: that the date when Torbay Health Scrutiny Board was advised by letter of Devon Partnership NHS Trust's decision to approve £4.6 million investment for the refurbishment of its older people's inpatient wards be provided to Board members.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 562, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 562, Councillor Thomas (J) declared a personal interest in the matter as a Board member of the Shekinah Mission.)

563. 'Closing the Gap' Inequalities Action Plan and Progress Update

The Board considered Report 101/2010 which provided information on actions and plans to address aspects of deprivation within Torbay. The Director of Public Health outlined the Closing the Gap project and evidence from the Marmot Review and other publications. Attached as Appendix One to Report 101/2010 was a draft of the Closing the Gap Action Plan.

In response to questioning and discussion about figures for hospital admissions for alcohol within Torbay, the Board was advised that seaside resorts had a distinctive range of health and wellbeing challenges.

Resolved: that members of the Health Scrutiny Board be provided with subsequent versions of the Closing the Gap Action Plan.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 563, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 563, Councillor Thomas (J) declared a personal interest in the matter as a Board member of the Shekinah Mission.)

Chairman