



Minutes of the Health Scrutiny Board

7 January 2010

-: Present :-

Councillor Carter (C), Faulkner (J), Kerslake, Phillips, and Thomas (J)

(Also in attendance: Councillors Bent and Lewis)

Please note these are draft minutes and subject to the approval of a future meeting of the Health Scrutiny Board

374. Election of Chairman

Councillor Kerslake was elected Chairman of the Health Scrutiny Board for the remainder of the 2009/2010 Municipal Year.

Councillor Kerslake in the Chair

375. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors John, Manning, and Morey.

376. Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting of the Health Scrutiny Board held on 3 December 2009 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

377. Public Consultation: Review of Older People's Day Services January 2010 – April 2010

The Board considered Report 001/2010 which provided information on a public consultation on a review of day care services for older people. The Board was advised that Torbay NHS Care Trust had initiated a review of day care services in early 2009 and that the key findings of the review had been presented to Torbay NHS Care Trust Board. Board members were informed that five options had been explored as part of the review of day care services for older people and three of the five options were being consulted upon. Members were advised that the consultation period would begin on 18 January and end on 18 April 2010.

The Board was advised of engagement undertaken during the review and the likely benefits of proposed changes, including the provision of a service to more clients for less cost and increased inter-generational opportunities.

In response to questions, the Board was advised that a risk-benefit analysis had been completed but had not been included in the paper. The Board discussed the need to view further information on the changes proposed to day care services for older people,

particularly a cost-benefit analysis of all five options, impact assessments of all options considered, a financial appraisal, a risk analysis, and an analysis of the Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats involved in the project.

Members questioned the consultation that had taken place with independent providers of day care services for older people and with carers. In reply, the Board was informed that all independent providers of day care services for older people in the Bay had been engaged with and that those nine providers that seemed keenest had been consulted with further. Members were informed that carers had been consulted prior to the development of the five options. The Board was informed that an options appraisal framework had identified the three options selected for consultation as the most beneficial.

With reference to the local authorities contacted and visited as part of the review of day care services for older people, members questioned whether only neighbouring local authorities were included. In reply, the Board was advised that a variety of Partnerships for Older People Projects (POPPs) were examined

Members questioned the number of clients involved in the review and the number of users of day care services for older people in the Bay. The Board was advised that 313 clients had been involved in the review and that the client population in Torbay was approximately thirty thousand. In response to questions concerning the statistical validity of the review and the generalisation of its findings to the client population in Torbay, members were advised that the consultation beginning on 18 January would increase the number of clients involved in the review.

Members questioned how confident Torbay NHS Care Trust was concerning the quality assurance and control of day care services in the independent and community sector. In response, the Acting Director of Commissioning, Torbay NHS Care Trust, advised that in-depth quality and impact assessments would be undertaken.

Members asked whether there was a strategy for Older People's Day Care in Torbay, what resources were dedicated to this strategy, and how the proposals fitted with this strategy. In addition, members asked what was the identified need from older people for day care services, how many older people currently attended such day care centres, how many of those attending had mild to moderate needs, how many had severe needs, and how many older people in the Bay had such needs. The Board was advised that this information requested would be provided.

The Board questioned whether some older people with dementia had been transported to day care services by taxi without a carer in attendance. The Acting Director of Commissioning, Torbay NHS Care Trust, indicated that a response to the concern would be obtained from the Acting Director of Operations, Torbay NHS Care Trust, and provided to the Board.

With reference to the effects of re-housing dementia sufferers, particularly the high number of sufferers that die within a year of being re-housed when a home residents have to move on, the Board asked whether similar outcomes were likely for dementia sufferers using day care if subject to substantial change. In reply, the Acting Director of Commissioning, Torbay NHS Care Trust, advised that she was not aware of any local or national research on the question but did not believe such results were likely.

Members asked whether Fernham Day Centre and St Edmunds Day Centre would close, the cost of such closures, and whether services would be re-located to the proposed Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre. In reply, the Board was informed that day services may change at St Edmunds Day Centre and there were no plans to completely close the centre. The Board was advised that the Fernham Day Centre building was in poor condition, the centre would close, and if provision was needed it would be re-located to the Clennon Valley Healthy Living Centre.

Members asked if Age Concern and other groups had been involved in the review. In response, the Board was informed that Age Concern was fully aware of the options being consulted upon.

Resolved: that further information on the changes proposed to day care services for older people, including a cost-benefit analysis of all five options, impact assessments of all five options considered, a financial appraisal, a risk analysis, and a Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats analysis, be provided to the Health Scrutiny Board.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 377, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

378. Gynaecological Cancer Services

The Board considered Report 002/2010 which provided information on the reconfiguration of gynaecological cancer services and sought a decision from the Health Scrutiny Board as to whether the proposals constituted a substantial variation or development of health services. The Report stated that the recommendation that the Royal Cornwall Hospitals Trust be designated as the peninsula's second specialist surgical centre for gynaecological cancer would not impact upon South Devon patients.

Members questioned the impact of the proposal and asked for an absolute assurance that patients from Torbay requiring surgery for gynaecological cancers would continue to go to Royal Devon and Exeter Hospital. In reply, the Acting Director of Commissioning, Torbay NHS Care Trust, informed the Board that unless they elected to receive surgery elsewhere patients from Torbay would go to Royal Devon and Exeter Hospital. The Acting Director of Commissioning, Torbay NHS Care Trust, indicated that the specialist surgical centre for gynaecological cancer proposed to be established in Cornwall would not impact upon Torbay's patients.

Resolved: that in light of the assurance that patients from Torbay requiring surgery for gynaecological cancers would continue to go to Royal Devon and Exeter Hospital, Torbay NHS Care Trust be advised that the Health Scrutiny Board considers that the proposal to establish a second specialist surgical centre for gynaecological cancers in Cornwall, alongside the current surgical centre at the Royal Devon and Exeter Hospital, does not constitute a substantial variation or substantial development to health services for Torbay.

(Note: Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 378, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.)

379. Director of Public Health Annual Report

The Board considered Report 003/2010 on the Annual Report by the Director of Public Health. The report highlighted developments to address health and wellbeing in Torbay. The Board was informed that evidence from a major national review of health inequalities, the Marmot review, would be used to inform a report being prepared that would identify additional practical steps that each agency in Torbay could take to address inequalities. The Board was advised that this report of additional practical steps would be presented to Torbay Strategic Partnership.

Members questioned the cost of publishing the Director of Public Health's Annual Report for 2009 and for details of the distribution of the document. In reply, the Director of Public Health indicated the information requested would be provided to the Board.

Board members requested evidence of results of past action plans to address health and wellbeing within Torbay, particularly for the most deprived wards and areas.

In response to questions concerning an above target number of drug users receiving treatment in the Bay, the Director of Public Health indicated that it was difficult to establish the exact number of drug users in the Bay and confirmed that there were a variety of referral methods for such treatment.

Resolved: (i) that the Director of Public Health provide the Health Scrutiny Board with information on her recommendations to agencies within Torbay; and

(ii) that the Director of Public Health provide the Health Scrutiny Board with information on health and wellbeing progress achieved in deprived areas within Torbay.

(Note: *Prior to consideration of the item in Minute 379, Councillor Bent declared a personal interest in the matter as two family members were employed by Torbay NHS Care Trust.*)

Chairman